Silcock, J.L., Fairfax, R.J. & Fensham, R.J. (2019). Feral fuchsia eating: long-term decline of a palatable shrub in grazed rangelands. *Journal of Arid Environments*, Vol. 163, Pp: 1-8

DOI: <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaridenv.2019.01.006</u>

© 2019. This manuscript version is made available under the CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 license <u>http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/</u>

1	Feral fuchsia eating: long-term decline of a palatable shrub in grazed rangelands		
2			
3	J.L. Silcock ^{A,D} , R.J. Fairfax ^B & R.J. Fensham ^{A,C}		
4			
5	^A Centre for Biodiversity and Conservation Science, National Environmental Science		
6	Program – Threatened Species Recovery Hub, University of Queensland, St Lucia, Australia,		
7	4072		
8	^B School of Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Queensland, St Lucia,		
9	Australia, 4072		
10	^C Queensland Herbarium, Department of Science, Information Technology, Innovation and		
11	the Arts, Brisbane Botanic Gardens, Mt Coot-tha Road, Toowong, 4066, Queensland		
12	^D Corresponding author: j.silcock@uq.edu.au		
13			
14	Abstract		

15 Long-lived palatable shrubs and trees in rangelands are particularly vulnerable to grazing impacts, with local extinctions and declines documented for numerous species. However, 16 population trends can be difficult to detect due to longevity of individuals and poor 17 understanding of regeneration patterns. We investigated the demography and conservation 18 status of the Grey Range fuchsia (Eremophila stenophylla Chinnock), a geographically 19 restricted and palatable shrub endemic to south-west Queensland. We documented 28 20 populations over 30,400 km², with an estimated total population size of 17,000 genetically 21 distinct individuals. Populations tend to be geographically disjunct, and twelve populations 22 23 contain <100 individuals. Seedling recruitment is rare and seedlings were only observed at six populations, all with low or intermittent grazing pressure. In contrast, vegetative recruits were 24 25 recorded at 19 populations and comprised at least 28% of all plants measured. Resprouting

ability confers some resilience to individuals, although repeated browsing restricts plant 26 growth, limiting flowering and fruiting. Consistently heavily grazed populations also contain 27 fewer plants. Goats and sheep are strongly associated with sites of high grazing pressure. 28 Although *Eremophila stenophylla* is secure in numerous populations with low and intermittent 29 grazing pressure, it qualifies as Vulnerable under IUCN criteria due to past and ongoing decline 30 at more than half of the known populations. Grazing relief is necessary to ensure the long-term 31 32 persistence of these populations. We predict that the same trajectory applies to numerous other semi-arid shrubs, and further research is required to elucidate the nature and extent of the 33 34 problem and implement grazing management to avert local extinctions.

35

36 Keywords: Australia, browsing impacts, extinction, resprouting, threatened species,
37 recruitment dynamics

38

39 1. Introduction

While emerging evidence suggests that arid zone ecosystems are more resilient to the effects 40 of introduced herbivores than previously supposed (Oba et al. 2000, Batanouny 2001, Fensham 41 et al. 2010, Bestelmeyer et al. 2013, Fensham et al. 2014), long-lived palatable perennial 42 species are known to be especially vulnerable (Chesterfield and Parsons 1985, Hunt 2001, 43 Nano et al. 2012, Auld et al. 2015). The adaptations of annual species and geophytes to 44 unpredictable rainfall confer resilience to grazing, as they grow and set seed before grazing has 45 severe impacts on populations (Sullivan and Rohde 2002, Silcock and Fensham 2013). Some 46 perennial species have adaptations that deter grazing, such as chemical compounds rendering 47 plants toxic or unpalatable (Robbins et al. 1987, Rebollo et al. 2002) or mechanical defences 48 such as tough foliage or sharp spines at least when plants are young (Lucas et al. 2000, Burns 49 2014). 50

It is the long-lived, palatable species without such defences that are considered most vulnerable 52 to sustained grazing pressure. Such plants are likely to be prevalent in ecosystems with low 53 54 evolutionary grazing pressure like Australia (Fensham and Fairfax 2008). Grazing impacts and lack of regeneration have been documented for some of these species, mostly in southern 55 Australian rangelands (Tiver and Andrew 1997, Watson et al. 1997b, Parsons 2000, Hunt 2001, 56 57 Read 2004, Auld et al. 2015). The slow attrition and eventual loss of these keystone species would have severe and ecosystem-wide structural, functional and biodiversity implications 58 59 (Denham and Auld 2004).

60

However, while the extinctions and ongoing declines of medium-sized mammals in the 61 62 Australian arid zone are well recognised (McKenzie et al. 2007, Woinarski et al. 2015), the decline of long-lived elements of the flora are harder to detect. Suspected declines are masked 63 by the longevity of individuals, meaning that they are persisting after 150 years of grazing, and 64 any declines or extinctions may take centuries to play out. There is also a lack of data on the 65 nature and extent of the problem. Recruitment dynamics for most species remain poorly 66 understood, particularly in terms of disentangling the effects of climate and grazing regime 67 (Crisp 1978, Gardiner 1986, Watson et al. 1997a). Numerous species are capable of both sexual 68 69 and clonal reproduction and the relative importance and frequency of these reproductive 70 modes, and how they are affected by grazing, are poorly-studied (O'Brien et al. 2014, Roberts et al. 2017). Are we witnessing slow but relentless extinction events across Australia's 71 rangelands, or simply natural cycles that operate at temporal scales beyond our short 72 73 observation span?

74

This study examines the demography and conservation status of a highly palatable, 75 geographically restricted shrub, Grey Range fuchsia *Eremophila stenophylla* Chinnock 76 (Chinnock 2007), in semi-arid south-western Queensland. The species is currently listed as 77 Vulnerable in Queensland under the Nature Conservation Act 1992 and classified nationally as 78 79 ROTAP 3K, with a geographic range of more than 100 km but occurring in small populations, poorly-known and suspected of being at risk of extinction (Briggs and Leigh 1996). We assess 80 81 the stand structure of all known populations under a range of grazing management, and shed light on broader issues relating to the persistence of palatable perennials in grazed landscapes. 82

83

84 2. Materials and methods

85 *2.1 Study area*

Eremophila stenophylla is endemic to south-western Queensland. The Grey Range, together 86 with smaller offshoot ranges, is the major topographic feature of the region. Comprised of 87 Tertiary sandstone, the elevation falls from 450 m above sea level on tablelands in the north-88 east to just over 200 m in the south, drained by the Bulloo and Barcoo Rivers. Feral goats 89 (*Capra hircus*) are patchily common and high numbers of native euros (*Macropus robustus*) 90 occur throughout the area, with domestic cattle (Bos taurus and B. indicus) and sheep (Ovies 91 aries) and native red (M. rufus) and grey kangaroos (M. giganteus) mostly restricted to the 92 93 lower slopes and valleys.

94

The climate is semi-arid with average annual rainfall decreasing from 485 mm in the northeast to 300 mm in the south-west of the species' range. Most rain falls from December to March. Summer temperatures are hot, with maximums throughout December-February averaging 35°C and regularly exceeding 40°C, while short winters are characterised by cold nights often falling below zero and warm days. The study was preceded by exceptional rainfall in 2010 and 2011, during which much of the study area received more than double its average
annual rainfall, followed by predominantly below-average rainfall totals from 2012-2016
(Bureau of Meteorology records, accessed September 2017). In the three months prior to
survey, the southern sites received between 29-34 mm, central sites 31 mm and northern sites
all <19 mm.

105

106 2.2 Field surveys and site measurements

Eremophila stenophylla was searched for throughout its range during rare and threatened plant
surveys in western Queensland between 2009 and 2014 (Silcock et al. 2014). All populations
were marked with a GPS, habitat described, population estimates made and browsing impacts
noted. Areas of apparently suitable habitat where the species was absent were also marked.

111

In August 2017, we measured the stand structure and browsing impacts at all known populations excepting two: one with only two mature individuals found, and one with <100 individuals on the Blackall-Emmet road disturbed by contemporary road works. Transects were of variable length and width depending on density of plants, such that at least 30 plants were measured (except where total population size was <30, in which case all plants were measured). Sites were placed in areas representative of the density, stand structure and level of browsing of the population. Transects ranged in size from 0.04 to 8.76 ha.

119

The diameter (0.5 cm thence nearest 1 cm) of all living stems was measured at 0.3 m above the ground. Stems <0.5 cm diameter were assigned as either seedlings or vegetative re-sprouts. Each plant was assigned a browse category: 0 = unbrowsed, 1 = some stems browsed, or browsed in past (noted if historic browsing), 2 = all stems browsed to browse height, and often torn down to within reach. Presence of flowers and number of fruits were also recorded for 125 each plant. We use the term 'browsing' to refer to herbivore impacts on *Eremophila*126 *stenophylla*, and grazing as a more general term when considering site-level pressure.

127

An index of recent grazing history was determined at each site using counts of herbivore dung 128 in 50 x 2 m belt transects (Fensham et al. 2010), with dung not present on the transect but 129 occurring within the site noted. Pellets of goats, sheep, cattle and rabbits were readily 130 131 distinguishable in the field along with macropods (primarily the euro Macropus robustus, red kangaroo M. rufus, and eastern grey kangaroo M. giganteus). Dung was split into 'old' (still 132 133 intact but dry and bleached) and 'fresh' (black) classes. Dung was considered 'fresh' if black or 'old' if dry and bleached but still intact. The presence of animal pads running through the 134 site was also noted. Recent total grazing pressure at each site were grouped based on dung 135 counts and pads into high, medium and low. Each site was also assigned a dominant historical 136 grazing regime (consistently low, moderate, high or intermittent), informed through tenure, 137 management information where available, and presence of deep animal pads that had clearly 138 been used for numerous years. 139

140

Distance to water was measured using GPS points taken of the nearest water (where seen during field work) or by examination of Geoscience Australia data verified by Google Earth, and with reference to the mapping of Silcock (2009). Permanent and semi-permanent (defined as containing water for approximately >70% of the time) waters were included, encompassing bores, large dams and earth tanks (>30 m across), natural springs and waterholes.

146

147 *2.3 Data analysis*

Preliminary explorations revealed no consistent relationship between habitat and populationsize, or between habitat and demography. The proportion of fertile individuals across the

sampling was ascertained for each size class. No data were normally distributed, even after log 150 transformation, so non-parametric Wilcoxon tests were used to explore dung density of each 151 main herbivore species, population size, and average number of plants per size class between 152 grazing regimes. Influence of recent browsing on individual plants was explored using the 153 proportion of individuals within each size class by browsing category (zero, some, all stems) 154 across recent grazing history (low, medium or high). All analyses were performed using the R 155 156 package (R Development Core Team 2015). Nomenclature follows Bostock and Holland (2007). 157

158

159 **3. Results**

160 *3.1 Population survey*

Eremophila stenophylla occurs patchily in a narrow band of south-west Queensland, with an 161 extent of occurrence of 30 400 km² and estimated area of occupancy of 500 km². It occurs in 162 four restricted areas: around the northern footslopes of the Grey and Gown Ranges south of 163 Isisford (9 populations documented); on the footslopes and narrow bands of open grassland 164 between the Grey and Cheviot Ranges south-west of Yaraka (15 populations); in a handful of 165 small populations on the western footslopes of the Grey Range some 100 km to the south; and 166 in two isolated southern populations in Walters Range west of Eulo (Figure 1). Extensive 167 searches were conducted between these known populations and outside its known range, thus 168 these seem to be true disjunctions. Records to the south-west of known populations previously 169 identified as Eremophila stenophylla in the Queensland Herbarium were visited and 170 determined to be the closely-related but distinct *Eremophila dalyana* (Chinnock 2007). 171

172

The species occupies three distinct habitats within its restricted range: rocky clay footslopes ofTertiary sandstone ranges (occasionally occurring to the upper slopes, where suitable clay soil

habitat exists), low open gidgee (Acacia cambagei) woodlands on often rocky clay soil, and 175 lightly wooded clay soil downs in broad valleys between ranges with scattered boree (Acacia 176 *tephrina*) and/or gidgee. The far southern population is distinct in occurring on top of a low 177 sandstone ridge, although also in open gidgee woodland. In the footslope habitat, abundance 178 ranges from occasional to locally dominant over small areas (<10 ha), while in the other 179 habitats the species typically occurs as isolated plants or in groups of <100 plants with 180 occasional clusters of thousands of young plants. The 28 known populations range in size from 181 two plants to >3000 (average estimated population size 400 plants), comprising nearly 11,000 182 183 plants in total. Our results show that at least 28% of all plants measured are resprouting from adult plants, thus the number of genetic individuals is likely to be closer to 8,500. Based on 184 habitat mapping and search effort, we estimate that around 50% of suitable habitat has been 185 186 surveyed, thus total population size is estimated at 17,000 plants.



188

Figure 1. *Eremophila stenophylla* distribution, south-west Queensland. Tertiary sandstone range habitat is shaded light-grey, and lightly wooded downs shaded dark-grey. Sites with consistently high grazing pressure marked with a red circle; yellow, consistently moderate; green, consistently light; orange, intermittent grazing pressure. Population size indicated by size of circles: smallest circles <100 plants, medium 100-1000, large >1000. Sites of targeted search effort where the species was not found are marked with black crosses.

- 195
- 196

198 *3.2 Plant traits and demographics*

In total, 1084 plants were measured across 26 sites. Plants have a multi-stemmed habit when 199 young even in the absence of browsing, such that four or five living stems are typical of a plant 200 whose largest stem diameter is 4-5 cm. Excluding plants <30 cm tall, the average number of 201 stems per individual was five and the highest 22 stems. Older plants tend to have fewer stems, 202 apparently because some stems twine around each other and grow together as the plant ages. 203 204 In other cases, some stems appear to die leaving only one or two main stems (Figure 2a). Old stems can die (sometimes due to browsing, other times apparently from drought) and new ones 205 206 can resprout from the base, conferring some resilience to stem death. Excluding plants <30 cm high, 20% of plants had a mixture of live and dead stems, but only 19 dead plants were recorded 207 across all sites; 11 of these were small plants (largest stem <2 cm diameter) that had been 208 209 recently killed by heavy browsing. Plants can also resprout after anthropogenic disturbance including land clearing and mechanical disturbance, as evidenced at two sites. 210

211



Figure 2. *Eremophila stenophylla*, showing (a) old plants (largest stem diameter >6 cm) in open downs habitat that have been browsed to herbivore height (in this case cattle); one or two stems have escaped browsing pressure while the ones within reach continue being defoliated and resprouting, and (b) a very woody plant about 1 m tall, that has resprouted repeatedly after

browsing, and is typical of plants with largest stem 1 cm diameter at moderately and heavilygrazed sites.

219

Seedlings were difficult to separate from vegetative resprouts, but attributed to 31 individuals 220 throughout six sites. Seedling recruitment is apparently a rare event but vegetative recruitment 221 occurs readily. Almost one-quarter of total individuals recorded were <30 cm high resprouts, 222 while an additional 6% >30 cm high (diameter of largest stem 0.5-2 cm) were also clearly 223 resprouting from adult plants. Plants with a largest stem diameter of ≥ 3 cm accounted for just 224 22% of plants measured, and those ≥ 6 cm 10%. Only 33 very large adults (largest stem >10 cm 225 diameter) were measured and these occurred across 11 sites. The largest stems recorded were 226 14-17 cm diameter, although there was an extreme outlier of 29 cm growing on the upper slopes 227 228 of Mt Grey south of Isisford.

229

Flowering was observed at 18/26 populations (118 plants) and fruiting on 4/1084 plants at two 230 populations. The most fruits seen on any plant was five. Flowering and fruiting were not related 231 to recent grazing pressure, but appeared related to recent rainfall as most plants in southern 232 populations were flowering and few flowers were observed at north-eastern populations. 233 Presence of flowers was strongly related to diameter of the largest stem, with proportion of 234 plants flowering increasing from 20% of plants at 2 cm diameter to 45% at 5 cm, where it 235 236 remained consistent as plants grew (Figure 3). Negligible flowering was observed in plants with stem diameters <1 cm. 237



Figure 3. (a) Flowers of *Eremophila stenophylla*, and (b) proportion of sampled population
fertile in August 2017 by stem size.

241

242 *3.3 Browsing impacts*

All populations occur within 3 km of semi-permanent or permanent water and almost 40% are 243 within 1 km, reflecting the productive and heavily-utilised nature of the habitat by domestic, 244 feral and native herbivores. There was no correlation between distance to water and dung 245 246 counts (recent, old and combined), either in total or for individual herbivore species. Macropods were the most abundant herbivore and present at all sites, in significantly higher 247 densities at medium and high compared to low grazing sites (Table 1). Cattle were present at 248 19 sites, goats at nine, sheep at four, and rabbits at two. Eleven sites had significantly lower 249 recent grazing pressure, which was largely driven by an absence of sheep and goats and 250 251 relatively low macropod and cattle abundance (Table 1). Ten sites had medium recent grazing pressure, generally comprised of cattle and macropods. Sheep and goats were restricted to sites 252 of high recent grazing pressure, which typically also had cattle present at low densities (Table 253 1). Of the six sites with high recent grazing pressure, goats and/or sheep were the main 254 herbivores at four, and cattle and macropods at two. Recent grazing pressure was generally 255

similar to historic grazing pressure, except in three cases where grazing pressure based on dung
counts and pads had been high in the past (due to goats at two sites and cattle at one), but was
low (no recent evidence of grazing) at one site and medium at two at the time of sampling.

259

Table 1. Dung counts, proportion of size classes and total population sizes by grazing regime
(consistently high, medium and low; three intermittently-grazed sites are not shown here). Stem
diameters >5 cm are uncommon and are not shown here. Significant differences between
grazing regimes are shown by superscripts.

	Low(n=9)	Medium (n=8)	High (n= 6)
Average dung counts (old and fresh)			
Cattle	1 ^A	2 ^A	2 ^A
Goats	0.1 ^A	1 ^A	68 ^B
Sheep	0 ^A	0.1 ^A	112 ^B
Macropods	34 ^A	190 ^B	195 ^B
Plant sizes (largest stem diameter)			
Average seedlings (% population)	3 ^A	0 ^A	0 ^A
Average resprouts (% population)	10 ^A	41 ^A	16 ^A
Average <1cm (% population)	28 ^A	23 ^A	23 ^A
Average 1-2 cm (% population)	33 ^A	15 ^A	32 ^A
Average 3-5cm (% population)	17 ^A	4 ^B	20 ^A
Average resprouts (number in population)	42 ^A	89 ^A	6 ^A
Average <1cm (number in population)	112 ^A	24 ^B	19 ^B
Average 1-2 cm (number in population)	177 ^A	116 ^{AB}	19 ^B
Average 3-5cm (number in population)	67 ^A	42 ^A	15 ^A
Average population size	420 ^B	285 ^B	65 ^{AB}

264

The influence of browsing on *Eremophila stenophylla* can be seen in Figure 4, showing an increasing proportion of affected individuals according to recent medium and high grazing pressure. Under high grazing pressure, 86% of plants measured were heavily browsed (browsing category 2), with resprouts and small plants (largest stem diameter <2 cm)

269 particularly susceptible (Figure 2b). The foliage of larger plants tended to have grown beyond the reach of herbivores (Figure 2a), and these were assigned browsing category 1 for evidence 270 of historic browsing. No plants in high grazing sites were ungrazed. Under medium grazing 271 pressure, two-thirds of plants were heavily browsed, and a further 20% browsed to some degree 272 (category 1). Smaller plants were also more likely to be heavily browsed under medium grazing 273 pressure, with over 80% of resprouts and nearly 50% of plants with the largest stem diameter 274 <1 cm assigned browsing category 2 (Figure 2b). Conversely, larger plants were more likely 275 276 to have been moderately browsed (category 1) at sites with low recent grazing pressure, mostly 277 due to historic browsing of stems, but overall 85% of plants at low grazing sites remained unbrowsed (Figure 4). 278

279

Over half of the 31 seedlings recorded occurred at a single site where past heavy grazing pressure had ceased (Mt Grey); most of the remainder occurred at two low grazing pressure sites on Idalia National Park. No seedlings were recorded at heavily grazed sites, and only a single seedling at consistently moderately-grazed sites (Figure 4).



285

Figure 4. Proportion of stems browsed by size class between recent grazing regimes. Size classes: s=seedlings (none in high recent grazing), 0 = basal resprouts; <1-5 cm – diameter of thickest stem. Only stems up to 5 cm are shown. Red bars = all stems browsed (browsing category 2; see Methods), orange = some stems browsed or historic browsing (browsing category 1), and green = no browsing of plant evident (browsing category 0).

The effect of browsing translates to smaller proportions of smaller plants at the population scale, as well as smaller population sizes (Figure 5). Average population size was significantly lower in consistently heavily grazed sites compared to sites with low and moderate grazing pressure (Table 1). Consistently heavily grazed populations have an average population size of 65 plants, compared to 285 plants for consistent medium grazing pressure populations and 425 for consistently low grazing pressure populations. At the time of survey, around 4% of plants

occur with high levels of grazing, 21% with moderate and 34% low. The three intermittently grazed populations together comprise 40% of the total known population. Populations with consistently low grazing pressure have higher numbers of plants with the largest stem diameter ≤ 1 cm (comprised of resprouts and seedlings), while consistently heavily grazed populations have relatively few small plants, and these are all heavily browsed (Figures 4 and 5).

303



304

Figure 5. Average demographics and size of *Eremophila stenophylla* populations by grazing regime, showing average number of stems per diameter in each grazing regime. Intermittent grazing regimes were assigned to three populations, and are not included here.

308

309

311 4. Discussion

Our results show that heavy browsing has a negative impact on the Grey Range fuchsia. While 312 re-sprouting may be promoted by browsing, any stem within herbivore reach is susceptible 313 (Figure 4) and recruitment is hindered at least in part by preventing stems attaining a size 314 capable of flowering (Figure 3). Despite this relatively short-term impact, populations in sites 315 of high and medium grazing pressure are characterised by a greater proportion of larger plants 316 317 and are significantly smaller than those under lower long-term grazing pressure. Unlike many studies of shrubs in Australian rangelands (Hall et al. 1964, Crisp 1978, Lange and Graham 318 319 1983, Denham and Auld 2004), rabbits are not suppressing recruitment, and were only present at two sites at low densities. While macropods occur at all sites and are often abundant, they 320 do not seem to browse the species heavily, probably due to their general preference for grass 321 and herbage (Dawson and Ellis 1994, Allen 2001). Sheep, cattle and especially goats graze the 322 Grey Range fuchsia heavily. Similar impacts of sheep and goats on recruitment and growth of 323 trees and shrubs are documented in rangelands of southern Australia (Lange and Purdie 1976, 324 Harrington 1979, Tiver and Andrew 1997), but relatively few studies have shown negative 325 effects of cattle on shrub recruitment and growth (Munro et al. 2009). 326

327

Eremophila stenophylla is capable of both sexual and vegetative reproduction, although the 328 former appears to be rare. Fruits were observed on just four plants in two populations at the 329 330 time of sampling, and 31 seedlings recorded across six populations. Natural attrition is common in arid zone seedlings (Lange and Graham 1983, Auld 1995a, Read 1995, Denham and Auld 331 2004, Tiver and Kiermeier 2006), although browsing has been shown to kill seedlings of some 332 species (Auld 1995b). Seedling recruitment was only observed at populations with low recent 333 grazing pressure, with the exception of one consistently moderately grazed site with a single 334 seedling present. This is despite recent wet years, during which much of the study area received 335

more than double its average annual rainfall in 2010 and well above-average totals for 2011(Bureau of Meteorology records, accessed September 2017).

338

Vegetative recruits were recorded at 19/26 populations, and comprised at least 28% of all plants 339 measured. This pattern of predominantly vegetative recruitment with occasional seedling 340 recruitment has been documented for other arid zone shrubs (Auld 1995a, Denham and Auld 341 342 2004), and may be a strategy for reproducing under resource-limited conditions (O'Brien et al. 2014). In this case, it is probably partly due to the complex physical and chemical dormancy 343 344 mechanisms common in the Eremophila genus (Richmond and Chinnock 1994). However, vegetative recruits were particularly susceptible to grazing, with 68% heavily grazed and 91% 345 grazed to some extent across all populations (Figure 4). Only vegetative recruits in sites with 346 consistently low grazing pressure were unbrowsed. 347

348

The prevalence of vegetative reproduction and the resprouting ability of the species confers 349 substantial resilience to browsing at an individual plant level. Of the 486 plants that were 350 experiencing heavy browsing pressure (category 2), only 11 had died, and plants can resprout 351 under consistent browsing pressure for at least a decade (J. Silcock, pers. obs.). Most plants 352 <30 cm tall were extremely woody at their bases indicating substantial age. When there is 353 browsing relief (e.g. during periods of destocking, or when stock disperse or have an abundance 354 355 of alternative food sources after rain), browsed stems shoot up and, if sufficient growth occurs, a single stem can exceed the reach of herbivores and become fecund. Such browsing-relief 356 periods are critical to the long-term persistence of populations. There are also chance events 357 such as fallen trees or seedlings germinating amidst unpalatable or spiny shrubs that can result 358 in enough plants in a population escaping browsing pressure and becoming reproductive to 359 ensure the long-term survival of the population, albeit as rare individuals. The ability to remain 360

alive during, and resprout following, repeated heavy grazing is an adaptation that is wellrecognised in fire-prone landscapes (Knox and Clarke 2004, Wright and Clarke 2007, Ondei et
al. 2016) but has seldom been documented as a mechanism to survive herbivore browsing.
Previous studies of arid-zone shrubs have shown that most repeatedly browsed vegetative
resprouts die within one or two years (Auld 1993, Auld 1995b), with the notable exception of *Casuarina pauper* (Auld 1995a).

367

Despite this resilience at an individual plant level, the significant difference in population sizes 368 369 between grazing regimes is instructive at the population scale. While browsed plants can persist for many years, if not decades, eventually they do die as evidenced from occasional dead plants 370 observed at sites. In the absence of sufficient plants that 'get away', populations will be 371 vulnerable to local extinction as older plants senesce and resprouts and seedlings are either 372 eventually killed or remain stunted and infertile due to constant browsing pressure. The attrition 373 of populations as grazing intensifies is reflected in the actual population sizes across these 374 regimes (Figure 5). High stocking rates have resulted in population declines of *Eremophila* 375 species elsewhere (Hacker 1984, Watson et al. 1997b). 376

377

Twelve of the 26 populations have all resprouts and plants within browse height heavily 378 379 browsed and no seedlings. These populations are comprised of very small numbers of plants 380 (average population size of 38 plants), suggesting they may not be viable in the long-term. There is little doubt that these populations have declined since pastoral settlement, and continue 381 to decline. Eremophila stenophylla warrants its current Vulnerable listing under the Nature 382 Conservation Act under IUCN criteria B2 (area of occupancy <2000 km² and severely 383 fragmented with continuing decline projected) and A4 (projected population reduction in both 384 the past and future where the causes of reduction have not ceased) (IUCN Standards and 385

Petitions Subcommittee 2017), and should be nominated for listing at federal level under theEnvironment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act.

388

Despite considerable resilience due to resprouting ability, the long-lived nature, palatability 389 and disjunct occurrences in narrow patches of relatively productive habitat render Eremophila 390 stenophylla especially vulnerable to declines due to overgrazing. Populations currently subject 391 392 to consistent moderate and high grazing do not appear to be viable in the long-term without considerable rest periods during wet seasons to allow vegetative recruits, and seedlings where 393 394 present, to escape browsing pressure. Long-term spelling at some sites will be extremely difficult to achieve, particularly where feral goats are difficult to control and where populations 395 occur in highly productive grazing country, and we recommend that at least parts of these sites 396 are fenced. Judicious fencing will also provide an opportunity to compare population dynamics 397 under different grazing regimes and further inform recruitment dynamics. We predict that 398 similar declines due to browsing are occurring for other palatable shrubs across the Australian 399 rangelands, and further research is required to elucidate the nature and extent of the problem 400 and implement grazing management to avert local extinctions. 401

402

403 Acknowledgements

We thank landholders for access and hospitality. Rosie Kerr and Tracy Wattz located additional
populations of the species on Idalia and Werewilka. This work was funded by the National
Environmental Science Program under the Threatened Species Recovery Hub.

407

408 **References**

Allen, C. B. 2001. Analysis of dietary competition between three sympatric herbivores in semi-arid
west Queensland. University of Sydney, Sydney.
Auld, T. D. 1993. The impact of grazing on regeneration of the shrub Acacia carnei in arid Australia
Biological Conservation 65:165-176.

- 413 Auld, T. D. 1995a. The impact of herbivores on regeneration in four trees from arid Australia.
 414 Rangeland Journal **17**:213-227.
- Auld, T. D. 1995b. Seedling survival under grazing in the arid perennial Acacia oswaldii. Biological
 Conservation **72**:27-32.
- Auld, T. D., A. Denham, M. Tozer, J. Porter, B. Mackenzie, and D. Keith. 2015. Saving arid and semiarid southern Australia after over 150 years of exotic grazing pressure: have we got the time
 and the will? Australasian Plant Conservation 24:3-5.
- Batanouny, K. A. 2001. Plants in the deserts of the Middle East.*in* J. L. Cloudsley-Thompson, editor.
 Adaptations of Desert Organisms. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.
- Bestelmeyer, B. T., M. C. Duniway, D. K. James, L. M. Burkett, and K. M. Havstad. 2013. A test of
 critical thresholds and their indicators in a desertification-prone ecosystem: more resilience
 than we thought. Ecology Letters 16:339-345.
- Bostock, P. D., and A. E. Holland, editors. 2007. Census of the Queensland Flora 2007. Queensland
 Herbarium, Environmental Protection Agency, Brisbane.
- Briggs, J. D., and J. H. Leigh. 1996. Rare or Threatened Australian Plants (4th edition) CSIRO
 Publishing, Canberra.
- Burns, K. C. 2014. Are there general patterns in plant defence againast megaherbivores? Biological
 Journal of the Linnean Society **111**:38-48.
- 431 Chesterfield, C. J., and R. F. Parsons. 1985. Regeneration of three tree species in arid south-eastern
 432 Australia. Aust. J. Bot. **33**:715-732.
- Chinnock, R. J. 2007. Eremophila and Allied Genera: a monograph of the Myoporaceae. Rosenberg
 Publishing Pty Ltd, Sydney.
- 435 Crisp, M. D. 1978. Demography and survival under grazing of 3 Australian semi-desert shrubs Oikos
 436 **30**:520-528.
- 437 Dawson, T. J., and B. A. Ellis. 1994. Diets of mammalian herbivores in Australian arid shrublands:
 438 seasonal effects on overlap between red kangaroos, sheep and rabbits and on dietary niche
 439 breadths and electivities. Journal of Arid Environments 26:257-271.
- Denham, A. J., and T. D. Auld. 2004. Survival and recruitment of seedlings and suckers of trees and
 shrubs of the Australian arid zone following habitat management and the outbreak of Rabbit
 Calicivirus Disease (RCD). Austral Ecology 29:585-599.
- Fensham, R. J., and R. J. Fairfax. 2008. Water-remoteness for grazing relief in Australian arid-lands.
 Biological Conservation 141:1447-1460.
- Fensham, R. J., R. J. Fairfax, and J. M. Dwyer. 2010. Vegetation responses to the first 20 years of
 cattle grazing in an Australian desert. Ecology **91**:681-692.
- Fensham, R. J., J. L. Silcock, and J. Firn. 2014. Managed livestock grazing is compatible with the
 maintenance of plant diversity in semidesert grasslands. Ecological Applications 24:503-517.
- Gardiner, H. G. 1986. Dynamics of perennial plants in the mulga (Acacia Aneura F. Muell) zone of
 Western Australia. I rates of population change. Australian Rangeland Journal 8:18-27.
- Hacker, R. B. 1984. Vegetation dynamics in a grazed mulga shrubland community. 1. The mid-storey
 shrubs. Australian Journal of Botany **32**:239-249.
- Hall, E. A. A., R. L. Specht, and C. M. Eardley. 1964. Regeneration of the vegetation on Koonamore
 vegetation reserve, 1926-1962. Australian Journal of Botany 12:205-264.
- Harrington, G. N. 1979. The effect of feral goats and sheep on the shrub populations in a semi-arid
 woodland. Australian Rangeland Journal 1:334-345.
- Hunt, L. P. 2001. Heterogeneous grazing causes local extinction of edible perennial shrubs: a matrix
 analysis. Journal of Applied Ecology **38**:238-252.
- Knox, K. J. E., and P. J. Clarke. 2004. Fire response syndromes of shrubs in grassy woodlands in the
 New England Tableland Bioregion. Cunninghamia 8:348-353.
- Lange, R. T., and C. R. Graham. 1983. Rabbits and the failure of regeneration in Australian arid zone
 Acacia. Australian Journal of Ecology 8:377–381.

- Lange, R. T., and R. Purdie. 1976. Western myall (Acacia sowdenii), its survival prospects and
 management needs. Australian Rangeland Journal 1:64-69.
- Lucas, P. W., I. M. Turner, N. J. Dominy, and N. Yamashita. 2000. Mechanical defences to herbivory.
 Annals of Botany 86.
- 467 McKenzie, N. L., A. A. Burbidge, A. Baynes, R. N. Brereton, C. R. Dickman, G. Gordon, L. A. Gibson, P.
 468 W. Menkhorst, A. C. Robinson, M. R. Williams, and J. C. Z. Woinarski. 2007. Analysis of
 469 factors implicated in the recent decline of Australia's mammal fauna. Journal of
 470 Biogeography **34**:597-611.
- 471 Munro, N. T., K. E. Moseby, and J. L. Read. 2009. The effects of browsing by feral and re-introduced
 472 native herbivores on seedling survivorship in the Australian rangelands. Rangeland Journal
 473 **31**:417-426.
- 474 Nano, C. E. M., A. E. Bowland, T. J. Nano, S. Raghu, and C. R. Pavey. 2012. Demographic hurdles to
 475 persistence in Acacia peuce (F. Muell.): Effects of resources, fire and browsing on a
 476 threatened keystone tree species from arid Australia. Journal of Arid Environments 80:17477 26.
- O'Brien, E. K., A. J. Denham, and D. J. Ayre. 2014. Patterns of genotypic diversity suggest a long
 history of clonality and population isolation in the Australian arid zone shrub Acacia
 carneorum. Plant Ecology 215:55-71.
- 481 Oba, G., N. C. Stenseth, and W. J. Lusigi. 2000. New perspectives on sustainable grazing management
 482 in arid zones of sub-saharan Africa. BioScience 50:35-50.
- Ondei, S., L. D. Prior, T. Vigilante, and D. M. J. S. Bowman. 2016. Post-fire resprouting strategies of
 rainforest and savanna saplings along the rainforest-savanna boundary in the Australian
 monsoon tropics. Plant Ecology **217**:711-724.
- Parsons, R. F. 2000. Enrichment-planting of the woody climbers *Marsdenia australis* and
 Rhyncharrhena linearis in north-western Victoria. Transactions of the Royal Society of South
 Australia 128:61-66.
- 489 Read, J. L. 1995. Recruitment characteristics of the white cypress pine (Callitris glaucophylla) in arid
 490 South Australia. Rangeland Journal **17**:228-240.
- 491 Read, J. L. 2004. Catastrophic drought-induced die-off of perennial chenopod shrubs in arid Australia
 492 following intensive cattle browsing. Journal of Arid Environments 58:535-544.
- Rebollo, S., D. G. Milchunas, I. Noy-Meir, and P. L. Chapman. 2002. The role of a spiny plant refuge in
 structuring grazed shortgrass steppe plant communities. Oikos **98**:53-64.
- Richmond, G. S., and R. J. Chinnock. 1994. Seed germination of the Australian desert shrub
 Eremophila (Myoporaceae). The Botanical Review 60:483-503.
- Robbins, C. T., T. A. Hanley, A. E. Hagerman, O. Hjeljord, D. L. Baker, C. C. Schwartz, and W. W.
 Mautz. 1987. Role of tannins in defending plants against ruminants: reduction in protein availability. Ecology 68:98-107.
- Roberts, D. G., C. N. Forrest, A. J. Denham, and D. J. Ayre. 2017. Clonality disguises the vulnerability
 of a threatened arid zone Acacia. Ecology and Evolution:1-10.
- Silcock, J. 2009. Identification of Permanent Refuge Waterbodies in the Cooper Creek & Georgina Diamantina catchments. South Australia Arid Lands Natural Resource Management Board.
- Silcock, J. L., and R. J. Fensham. 2013. Arid vegetation in disequilibrium with livestock grazing:
 Evidence from long-term exclosures. Austral Ecology **38**:57-65.
- Silcock, J. L., A. J. Healy, and R. J. Fensham. 2014. Lost in time and space: re-assessment of
 conservation status in an arid-zone flora through targeted field survey. Australian Journal of
 Botany 62:674-688.
- 509Subcommittee, I. S. a. P. 2017. Guidelines for Using the IUCN Red List Categories and Criteria.510Version 13. Prepared by the Standards and Petitions Subcommittee. Downloadable from511http://www.iucnredlist.org/documents/RedListGuidelines.pdf.
- Sullivan, S., and R. Rohde. 2002. On non-equilibrium in arid and semi-arid grazing systems. Journal of
 Biogeography 29:1595-1618.

- Team, R. D. C. 2015. R: a language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for
 Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. Available at <u>http://www.R-project.org/</u>.
- Tiver, F., and M. H. Andrew. 1997. Relative effects of herbivory by sheep, rabbits, goats and
 kangaroos on recruitment and regeneration of shrubs and trees in eastern South Australia.
 Journal of Applied Ecology 34:903-914.
- Tiver, F., and A. Kiermeier. 2006. Survivorship of seedlings of false sandalwood (Myoporum
 platycarpum) in the chenopod rangelands grazed by sheep, kangaroos and rabbits at
 Whyalla, South Australia Austral Ecology **31**:376-387.
- Watson, I. W., M. Westoby, and A. M. Holm. 1997a. Continuous and episodic components of
 demographic change in arid zone shrubs: models of two Eremophila species from Western
 Australia compared with published data on other species. Journal of Ecology 85:833-846.
- Watson, I. W., M. Westoby, and A. M. Holm. 1997b. Demography of two shrub species from an arid
 grazed ecosystem in Western Australia 1983-93. Journal of Ecology 85:815-832.
- Woinarski, J. C. Z., A. A. Burbidge, and P. L. Harrison. 2015. Ongoing unraveling of a continental
 fauna: Decline and extinction of Australian mammals since European settlement.
 Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America 112:4531 4540.
- Wright, B. R., and P. J. Clarke. 2007. Resprouting responses of *Acacia* shrubs in the Western Desert of
 Australia fire severity, interval and season influence survival. International Journal of
 Wildland Fire **16**:317-323.